

MINUTES

Agenda for Treasure Valuation Committee Meeting – 19th August 2015

The meeting was held in the Hartwell Room at the British Museum on Wednesday, 19th August 2015 at 11:00 am.

Present

Committee

Colin Renfrew (Chair)
Jim Brown
Marian Campbell
Ian Carradice
Peter Clayton

British Museum

Michael Lewis
Mafalda Raposo
Ian Richardson
Claudia Stedmond

Apologies

Harry Bain
Mark Caldon (DCMS)
Hetty Gleave
Tim Pestell

Item 1: Minutes of the meeting of Wednesday, 8th July 2015

These were passed as a true record of the meeting.

Item 2: Objects

Bronze Age artefacts

1. Bronze Age copper alloy axe and fragment from Llancarfen, Vale of Glamorgan (13.26, NMGW-14B441)

The provisional valuer suggested £160. The Committee inspected the pieces in light of this and expressed the view that they were of good metal but that they would command a lower price on the market. The Committee recommended £120. National Museum Wales hopes to acquire.

2. Bronze Age gold penannular ring from East Cambridgeshire area (2014 T133, CAM-5B1D08)

The provisional valuer suggested £400. The Committee examined the ring in light of this, noting that it had valued a number of similar rings in the past. As the example was plated, with a base metal core, the Committee felt that the suggested figure was accurate, and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £400. Ely Museum hopes to acquire.

3. Bronze Age gold penannular ring from Betchworth, Surrey (2014 T790, SUR-8F221C)

The provisional valuer suggested £800. The Committee viewed the ring in light of this and, noting that it was heavy and solid, felt that the suggested value was correct. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £800. Dorking Museum hopes to acquire.

4. Bronze Age copper alloy fragments (4) and penannular gold ring from Cwm Cadnant Community, Anglesey (13.13, NMGW-04216C)

The provisional valuer suggested £1,100. The Committee examined the hoard in light of this and commented that most of its value was linked to the gold penannular ring. It noted that the ring was solid, rather than plated, and admired its striking decoration. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £1,100. Oriel Ynys Môn hopes to acquire.

5. Bronze Age copper alloy hoard (11) from Azerley, North Yorkshire (2014 T442, YORYM-15AA2D)

The provisional valuer suggested £1,115. The finder submitted comments regarding the provisional valuation, which he felt to be too low. The Committee took account of these as it viewed the hoard. It agreed that the suggested value for the large annular ring was too low, and the Committee recommended £200 for that piece. It also agreed that the valuer appeared to have miscounted the number of whole axes that were represented by two pieces, and that there were in fact two of these, rather than one, as suggested by the valuer. In terms of the values of the axes, the Committee felt that the provisional valuer was correct, so it added £15 to account for the misattribution of one of the axes that was broken in two pieces (valued at £65 each) as an incomplete axe (valued at £15 each).

The finder drew attention to several Bronze Age copper-alloy hoards of socketed and palstave axes previously valued by the Committee where the value per axe was higher than the suggested figure here, but the Committee pointed out that this was a selective list. It referred to other examples, including 2011 T429 (PAS-1EB110) which also contained four socketed axes valued at £150 each, and 2013 T583 (YORYM-958D05) which contained more than 10 socketed axes and where the entire hoard was valued at £1,050. The Committee explained that the value it assigned to each item was relative to its condition and desirability. In this case, it felt that the provisional valuer's suggestion of £150 per complete axe to be accurate. The Committee recommended an overall value of £1,305. York Museums Trust hopes to acquire.

Roman artefacts

6. Roman silver finger-ring from Collingham, Nottinghamshire (2014 T265, LVPL-D46C37)

The provisional valuer suggested £100. The Committee examined the ring in light of this and felt that its poor condition would hinder its appeal on the market. The Committee recommended £60. Newark Museum hopes to acquire.

7. Roman gold finger-ring from Elmley Lovett, Worcestershire (2014 T297, WAW-0DBDE5)

The provisional valuer suggested £150. The Committee inspected the ring in light of this and took account of the ring's condition and heavy wear that it had been subject to. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £150. Worcestershire Museums hopes to acquire.

Early Medieval artefacts

8. Early Medieval silver-gilt disc brooch (two fragments) from East Hendred, Oxfordshire (2014 T432, BERK-83BECB)

The provisional valuer suggested £65. The Committee examined the brooch in light of this and felt that it was a fair value, given the current condition of the brooch, which was fragmentary and missing its inlays. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £65. Oxfordshire Museum Service hopes to acquire.

9. Early Medieval silver mount from Sturminster Marshall, Dorset (2014 T500, DOR-FCD100)

The provisional valuer suggested £700-£900. The Committee examined the mount in light of this and observed that of the comparanda suggested by the valuer, the item bearing the most resemblance to the Sturminster Marshall mount was item 6, the Knotwork Pin Link, which sold for a retail price of £850. The Committee therefore felt that the lower end of the provisional valuer's suggested range was appropriate, and recommended £700. Dorset County Museum hopes to acquire.

10. Early Medieval gold and garnet object from Milton under Wychwood, Oxfordshire (2014 T750, SUR-A393CC)

The provisional valuer suggested £550-£650. The Committee inspected the item in light of this and noted its tiny size and poor condition, but acknowledged that it had been finely made. In agreement with the figure at the lower end of the valuer's suggested range, the Committee recommended £550. Oxfordshire Museum Service hopes to acquire.

11. Early Medieval silver hooked tag from Andover, Hampshire (2013 T865, HAMP-0B4001)

The provisional valuer suggested £500-£600. The Committee viewed the hooked tag in light of this and commented on its large size and appealing design. It was noted that a number of these items were available on the market. The Committee had also valued many hooked tags in past and felt that the lower end of the valuer's suggested range represented a fair assessment of the desirability of this item. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £500. Hampshire Cultural Trust hopes to acquire.

12. Early Medieval silver-gilt strap end (incomplete) from Nuffield, Oxfordshire (2014 T666, SUR-970F39)

The provisional valuer suggested £3,000-£4,000. The Committee examined the strap-end in light of this and noted that the parallels provided by the valuer were not close comparisons. The Committee commented on the attractive engraving of the Lamb of God and the presence of the inscription, which were felt to contribute to the interest of the piece. For that reason it was felt to

be worth more than many strap ends of the period. Nonetheless its incomplete nature was believed by the Committee to warrant a value at the low end of the valuer's suggested range, and the Committee recommended £3,000. Oxfordshire Museum Service hopes to acquire.

13. Early Medieval gold finger-ring from Tendring District area, Essex (2014 T939, ESS-9CB5B8)

The provisional valuer suggested £1,200-£1,500. The Committee examined the finger-ring in light of this and found that the comparisons provided by the valuer represented a huge disparity, and that most were not relevant to the case at hand. The Committee noted that the valuer's Figure 3 was the closest comparison but was larger than the Tendring District ring and had only achieved £450 at auction. The Committee therefore felt unable to recommend a figure close to the suggested range of the valuer. It recommended £600. Colchester & Ipswich Museum Service hopes to acquire.

NB: The Committee asked the Secretariat to write to the valuer and explain that the Committee was surprised at the value that had been put on the piece, in light of the comparisons that had been provided, and that it was unable to recommend a figure above £600. This was not felt to be helpful, since the interested parties would have been led to expect a much higher reward.

14. Early Medieval silver-gilt mount from Market Weighton, East Riding of Yorkshire (2014 T886, YORYM-C6C515)

The provisional valuer suggested £6,500-£8,500. The Committee examined the mount in light of this. It noted that it had valued a much larger Early Medieval silver-gilt mount, of which a human face formed one component, from Thimbleby, Lincolnshire (2009 T175, NLM-219C93) for £8,000. The comparisons suggested by the provisional valuer were mostly felt to be irrelevant, and the closest piece was thought to be the suggested Figure 7 (Viking silver-gilt bearded face pendant) which sold for £1,500. On this evidence the appropriate value for the Market Weighton mount would have seemed to have been lower than the valuer suggested. The Committee felt that it required further advice before recommending a figure, and it requested a second provisional valuation. Hull & East Riding Museum Service hope to acquire.

15. Early Medieval gold sword pommel from Cannons Ashby, Northamptonshire (2014 T47, LON-F73775)

The provisional valuer suggested £2,500-£3,500. The finder submitted a private valuation carried out by ██████████ of Duke's for £5,000-£10,000. The Committee took account of this as it viewed the pommel, noting that ██████████ had based his valuation on photographs of the item. The Committee observed that the pommel had a copper core, and was incomplete. It felt that it required further information before recommending a value, and asked that a second provisional valuation be commissioned. Ashby House, National Trust, hopes to acquire.

16. Early Medieval gold pendant from Monkton, Kent (2013 T646, KENT-8EC696)- 2nd viewing

The first provisional valuer suggested £3,500-£5,000. The finder had supplied comments on the valuation. The Committee saw the pendant at its meeting of 20th May 2015 and requested a second valuation and more information from the Secretariat regarding the comparison provided by the finder, from Sutton-on-the-Forest, North Yorkshire (MMET255; YORYM-3F57C3). The second provisional valuer suggested £5,000 and the Committee viewed the item again. The Committee also had before it the papers from the case from Sutton-on-the-Forest.

The Committee noted that the provisional valuation for the Sutton-on-the-Forest fitting compared the item to an Early Medieval gold aestel ('The Bowleaze Jewel') which had sold for £42,425. The Sutton-on-the-Forest fitting was subsequently valued by the Committee at £50,000 in June 2001. The current Committee commented that without the minutes of the meeting it could not fully understand the rationale of the members at the time, but observed that £50,000 seemed a very high amount. The Committee further noted that the Sutton-on-the-Forest fitting was larger than the piece under discussion, being twice the weight.

The two provisional valuations for the gold pendant from Monkton were seen to be close in value, and the Committee felt that they suggested a realistic market value of the item. Taking all of this into account, in agreement with the provisional valuers, the Committee recommended £5000. Canterbury Museum hopes to acquire.

[Michael Lewis left the room]

Medieval Artefacts

17. Medieval silver-gilt brooch from Blythe, Nottinghamshire (2014 T974, SWYOR-7F4A5E)

The provisional valuer suggested £80. The Committee examined the brooch in light of this and noted its small size and the presence of an inscription. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £80. Newark Museum hopes to acquire.

18. Medieval silver buckle or brooch from Ludlow area, Shropshire (2013 T934, HESH-9A7025)

The provisional valuer suggested £20. The Committee viewed the item in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £20. Shropshire County Museum Service hopes to acquire.

19. Medieval silver brooch from Lamphey, Pembrokeshire (13.20, NMGW-4A1C32)

The provisional valuer suggested £25. The Committee inspected the brooch in light of this and taking account of the damage that it had suffered, in agreement with the provisional valuer, it recommended £25. National Museum Wales hopes to acquire.

20. Medieval gold brooch from Melmerby, North Yorkshire (2014 T858, DUR-4A3A73)

The provisional valuer suggested £80. The Committee examined the brooch in light of this and found it to be a small but attractive example and recommended £120. Harrogate Museum hopes to acquire.

21. Medieval silver crucifix from Waddington area, Lancashire (2014 T350, LANCUM-E0C267)

The provisional valuer suggested £100. The Committee viewed the crucifix in light of this. It explained that it had valued a similar item from Amport, Hampshire (2014 T625, HAMP-17DDC6) at £300, though the Amport example was larger and more complete, retaining its suspension loop. Nonetheless the Committee felt the provisional valuation for the Waddington area crucifix was low, and recommended £150. Museum of Lancashire hopes to acquire.

22. Medieval silver toilet implement from Moor Monkton, North Yorkshire (2015 T106, YORYM-B6229D)

The provisional valuer suggested £20. The Committee inspected the toilet implement in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £20. Harrogate Museum hopes to acquire.

23. Medieval to Post-Medieval silver finger-ring from Stanhope, Durham (2014 T528, DUR-8E1C52)

The provisional valuer suggested £200. The Committee viewed the finger-ring in light of this and observed that it was a sturdy example but in poor condition, and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £200. Durham University Museum hopes to acquire.

24. Medieval silver bar mount from Potterne, Wiltshire (2013 T561, SUR-320483)

The provisional valuer suggested £40. The Committee examined the bar mount in light of this and agreed that it was interesting but very small. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £40. Wiltshire Heritage Museum hopes to acquire.

25. Medieval silver brooch from South Gloucestershire area (2014 T856, HESH-497CD5)

The provisional valuer suggested £400-£500. The Committee viewed the brooch in light of this and noted its small size, but commented that it was an attractive example, especially as it retained its glass/gemstones. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £450. Museum in the Park, Stroud, hopes to acquire.

26. Medieval gold finger-ring from Wycliffe with Thorpe, Durham (2014 T675, LVPL-BDC0C3)

The provisional valuer suggested £1,500. The finder supplied comments on the provisional valuation, which he felt to be too low. The Committee took account of these as it viewed the ring. The Committee commented that it had valued many Medieval gold rings set with sapphires, many of which were heavier and more substantial, for instance one from Mowsley, Leicestershire (2012

T245, LEIC-C03C23, 5.24g) valued at £3,000 or one from Hereford, Herefordshire (2011 T159, HESH-C17D7, 4.73g) valued at £1,200. A comparison of similar weight to the Wycliffe with Thorpe piece was one from Chichester, West Sussex (2006 T63, SWYOR-C57B83, 2.46g) and was valued at £850, though its hoop was more distorted. The range in values for these rings reflected their condition and attractiveness, and the Committee felt that the lack of substance and damage to the ring from Wycliffe with Thorpe would hinder its appeal on the market. The Committee recommended £1,200. Auckland Castle Trust hopes to acquire.

Post-Medieval Artefacts

27. Post-Medieval silver-gilt cap hook from Bridgnorth area, Shropshire (2015 T128, WMID-483471)

The provisional valuer suggested £100. The Committee inspected the cap hook in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £100. Shropshire County Museum Service hopes to acquire.

28. Post-Medieval silver-gilt dress-hook from Rainford, St Helens (2014 T71, LVPL-4A0113)

The provisional valuer suggested £60-£80. The Committee viewed the dress-hook in light of this and taking account of the damage it had suffered, felt that the figure at the lower end of the valuer's suggested range was appropriate. It recommended £60. National Museums Liverpool hopes to acquire.

29. Post-Medieval silver-gilt dress fitting from South Heindley, West Yorkshire (2014 T465, SWYOR-D16779)

The provisional valuer suggested £10. The Committee examined the dress fitting in light of this and felt that the suggestion was accurate for a piece in such an incomplete state. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £10. Wakefield Museum hopes to acquire.

30. Post-Medieval silver-gilt dress-hook from Burlescombe, Devon (2014 T356, DEV-47CC5E)

The provisional valuer suggested £30. The Committee viewed the dress-hook in light of this and in agreement with the valuer, recommended £30. The Royal Albert Memorial Museum hopes to acquire.

31. Post-Medieval silver-gilt badge/ mount (incomplete) from Hilton, Dorset (2014 T160, DOR-857850)

The provisional valuer suggested £135. The Committee inspected the badge in light of this and felt that it had an attractive presence and that an accurate figure would be at the top of the valuer's suggested range. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £150. Dorset County Museum hopes to acquire.

32. Post-Medieval silver-gilt dress pin-head from Yarcombe, Devon (2014 T377, DEV-FA8131)

The provisional valuer suggested £30. The Committee viewed the pin-head in light of this and commented that its poor condition would preclude it from reaching the figure suggested by the valuer. The Committee recommended £20. Allhallows Museum hopes to acquire.

33. Post-Medieval silver-gilt dress pin-head from Cambridgeshire (2013 T415, CAM-9C1C65)

The provisional valuer suggested £30. The Committee inspected the pin-head in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £30. Ely Museum hopes to acquire.

34. Post-Medieval silver bell from Totton & Eling, Hampshire (2014 T542, HAMP-B6F6D9)

The provisional valuer suggested £5. The Committee examined the bell in light of this and felt that a slightly higher nominal figure was appropriate, and recommended £10. Hampshire Cultural Trust hopes to acquire.

35. Post-Medieval silver thimble from Ickford, Buckinghamshire (2014 T665, BERK-B09450)

The provisional valuer suggested £100. The Committee viewed the thimble in light of this. It noted that the thimble had been declared Treasure but that it was likely to date from the late 18th Century. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £100. Buckinghamshire County Museum hopes to acquire.

36. Post-Medieval silver dress pin from St Athan, Vale of Glamorgan (12.01, NMGW-91F46E)

The provisional valuer suggested £40. The Committee inspected the dress pin in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £40. National Museum Wales hopes to acquire.

37. Post-Medieval silver dress pin from Lamphey, Pembrokeshire (13.21, NMGW-4A61A6)

The provisional valuer suggested £30. The Committee viewed the dress pin in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £30. National Museum Wales hopes to acquire.

38. Post-Medieval silver scabbard chape from Biddulph, Staffordshire (2014 T843, LVPL-3A17B4)

The provisional valuer suggested £25. The Committee examined the chape in light of this and noted its poor condition, which the Committee felt would prevent it from achieving the suggested figure. The Committee recommended £20. Potteries Museum & Art Gallery hopes to acquire.

39. Post-Medieval silver scabbard chape from Burghfield, West Berkshire (2014 T667, SUR-057082)

The provisional valuer suggested £100. The Committee inspected the chape in light of this and felt this was an interesting example. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £100. West Berkshire Museum hopes to acquire.

40. Post-Medieval gold finger-ring from Lewknor, Oxfordshire (2014 T626, BH-1BC17E)

The provisional valuer suggested £200. The Committee viewed the finger-ring in light of this and commented that its condition was unfortunately very poor, and that this would hinder its appeal on the market. The inscription was felt to possess some interest, however, because as the valuer pointed out, it was an addition to those recorded by Joan Evans in 1931. The Committee recommended £150. Oxfordshire Museum Service hopes to acquire.

41. Post-Medieval gold finger-ring from Blythe Bridge area, Staffordshire (2014 T681, WMID-D4D986)

The provisional valuer suggested £500. The Committee examined the finger-ring in light of this and found the parallel suggested to be very reasonable. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £500. Potteries Museum & Art Gallery hopes to acquire.

42. Post-Medieval gold finger-ring from Pennard, West Glamorgan (10.16, NMGW-4AF507)

The provisional valuer suggested £1,000. The Committee viewed the finger-ring in light of this and found it to be an attractive example. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £1,000. Swansea Museum hopes to acquire.

43. Post-Medieval gold finger-ring from Llantwit Major, Vale of Glamorgan (13.25, NMGW-4AB918)

The provisional valuer suggested £1,000. The finder submitted comments on this and items for comparison. The Committee took account of this as it examined the finger-ring. It firstly pointed out that the TimeLine Auction results quoted in Treasure Hunting magazine included the buyer's commission and so were higher than the actual auction hammer price (cf. Lot 722 from the sale of 27-30 May 2015 had a hammer price of £1,300, and the price quoted in Treasure Hunting was £1,612). The Committee refers to the actual hammer price as representing the value of an item.

The ring from Llantwit Major was felt to be delicate but featured an attractive inscription and was a wearable size, which the Committee felt would enhance its appeal on the market. Taking all of this into consideration, the Committee recommended £1,500. National Museum Wales hopes to acquire.

44. Post-Medieval gold pendant from Skellow, Doncaster (2013 T807, SWYOR-7346E4)- 3rd viewing

The first provisional valuer suggested £5,000; the second provisional valuer suggested £800. The finder and landowner had supplied comments and the museum had supplied comments and comparanda, and the Committee viewed the pendant at its meeting of 4th February 2015,

recommending £5000. The museum challenged this valuation and the Committee viewed the pendant again at its meeting of 9th April 2015, where asked for further information from the first provisional valuer and requested a third provisional valuation. The first provisional valuer supplied comments on his valuation, and the third provisional valuer suggested £4,000-£6,000, and the museum supplied further comments.

The Committee took all of the above into consideration as it viewed the pendant again. The Committee understood the museum's position regarding the foreign provenance of the examples used by the third valuer, and the fact that those items were decorated with jewels which enhanced their appeal. Nonetheless the Committee felt that those comparisons had been correctly interpreted by the third valuer as pointing towards a range of £4,000 - £6,000 for the Skellow pendant, and the Committee felt that the middle of the range represented an accurate estimate of its market value. The Committee confirmed a recommendation of £5,000. Doncaster Museum hopes to acquire.

Item 3: Coins

Roman Coins

45. Roman silver coins (catalogue numbers 2 & 6 only) from Warmington, Warwickshire (2013 T529, PAS-9ECB6B)

The provisional valuer suggested £25 for the Republican denarius and £2,000 for the denarius of Caligula. The Committee viewed the coins in light of this and expressed the view that the valuations were well-supported with relevant evidence. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £2,025. Warwickshire Museum hopes to acquire.

46. Roman silver coin hoard (4) from Western Hertfordshire area (2014 T669, BH-A74A1A)

The provisional valuer suggested £5. The finder submitted comments regarding the provisional valuation, which he felt was too low. He also supplied market comparisons. The Committee took account of this as it viewed the four coins. The Committee explained that the coins are classed as 'Treasure' because of their age and precious metal content, and that the definition of Treasure does not indicate that items so classed possess a certain commercial value. In this case the Committee felt that the condition of the coins was indeed very poor, and worse than that of the comparisons suggested. The Committee agreed that a £10 valuation was appropriate, this being the usual minimum. Three Rivers Museum hopes to acquire.

47. Roman silver pierced coin from The Stukeleys Parish area, Cambridgeshire (2014 T882, CAM-08511D)

The provisional valuer suggested £10. The Committee examined the coin in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £10. The Fitzwilliam Museum hopes to acquire.

Medieval coins:

48. Medieval silver coins (14) from Halesworth area, Suffolk (2014 T264, SF-78CCD3)

The provisional valuer suggested £106. The Committee viewed the coins in light of this and found the valuation to be well prepared and broken down. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £106. Halesworth & District Museum hopes to acquire.

49. Medieval silver piedfort from Filkins area, Oxfordshire (2015 T49, WILT-158D62)

The provisional valuer suggested £515. This case was deferred to the next meeting at the request of the finder. Oxfordshire Museum Service hopes to acquire.

50. Medieval silver coins (9) from Blandford area, Dorset (2013 T776, DOR-BBD727)

The provisional valuer suggested £2,955. The Committee examined the coins in light of this and commented that the valuation was accurate and well-supported by auction evidence. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £2,955. Dorset County Museum hopes to acquire.

51. Medieval gold (5) and silver (12) coins from Wenvoe, Vale of Glamorgan (12.22, NMGW-630E70)

The provisional valuer suggested £5,620. The finder submitted comments regarding the provisional valuation, which he thought was too low for the gold coins in the hoard. The Committee took

account of this as it examined the coins. It took the view that the valuations for the coins numbered 2 and 3 were slightly on the conservative side, and that both could possibly achieve a higher figure at auction. To account for this, as the remainder of the coins were felt to have been accurately assessed by the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £6,000. National Museum Wales hopes to acquire.

Post-Medieval Coins

52. Post-Medieval silver (4) and copper alloy (1) coins from Southrowtham, West Yorkshire (2012 T872, SWYOR-E255C5)

The provisional valuer suggested £38. The Committee inspected the coins in light of this and felt that the valuation adequately accounted for their condition and desirability. In agreement with the provisional valuer, the Committee recommended £38. Calderdale Museum hopes to acquire.

53. Post-Medieval silver (5) from Elland, West Yorkshire (2012 T871, SWYOR-E23852)

The provisional valuer suggested £60. The Committee examined the coins in light of this and in agreement with the provisional valuer, recommended £60. Calderdale Museum hopes to acquire.

[Jim Brown left the room]

Item 4: Norfolk Cases

54. Medieval gold pendant from Holt area, Norfolk (2014 T515, NMS-8D82BB)

The provisional valuer suggested £250-£350. The finder and landowner submitted comments regarding the provisional valuation, which they felt to be too low. The Committee took this into consideration when viewing the cross pendant. It understood the concern of the finder and landowner and felt that a second provisional valuation was required before a value was recommended. The Committee agreed to reconsider the case when the second provisional valuation is received. Norwich Castle Museum hopes to acquire.

[Jim Brown re-entered the room]

55. Medieval gold brooch from West Norfolk area, Norfolk (2014 T148, NMS-F42931)- 2nd viewing

The provisional valuer suggested £2,000. The Committee had seen the brooch at its meeting of 20th May 2015 and recommended a value of £2,000. The finder challenged the valuation, pointing out that the Committee had valued a similar brooch from Warwick (MME T446, PAS-66CB63) at £2,500. The Committee took this into consideration as it viewed the brooch again. It noticed that the comparison from Warwick was roughly the same size (both weighing 3.0g) and were similarly adorned with gemstones. The West Norfolk brooch was seen to have slightly more elaborate decoration but on balance the Committee felt that it possessed the same level of attraction as the Warwick brooch, and the Committee recommended £2,500. Norwich Castle Museum hopes to acquire.

56. Post-Medieval gold finger-ring from Kenninghall, Norfolk (2014 T325, NMS-CF8A96)- 2nd viewing

The provisional valuer suggested £600-£800. The Committee had seen the item at its meeting of 20th May 2015, and recommended £600. The finder challenged this valuation and said he felt the valuation should be £700. The Committee reviewed the case again. It agreed with the finder that the ring from Kenninghall was indeed heavier and more attractive than the comparison cited by the provisional valuer (TimeLine Auctions 18th March 2011 Lot 839) which had sold for £500, but explained that this is why it had recommended a figure greater than that amount, settling at £600. Finding nothing further in the finder's correspondence to cause it to amend its earlier valuation, the Committee confirmed a figure of £600. Norwich Castle Museum hopes to acquire.

Item 5: British Museum Cases

57. Bronze Age gold lock ring from East of Colchester area, Essex (2014 T193, ESS-C0C162)- 2nd viewing

The first provisional valuer suggested £1,300. The Committee viewed the lock ring at its meeting of 8th July 2015 and requested a second provisional valuation. The second provisional valuer suggested £600. The Committee examined the lock ring again in light of this. It commented that the first valuer had been overly optimistic of the potential of the item, given the damage it had sustained, and felt that the second valuer's figure was more accurate. This was also reinforced by the Committee's own valuations of similar items that had come before it in the past, including an example from Edlesborough, Buckinghamshire (2009 T513, BH-8DC056, 2.4g) valued at £500 and one from Whitchurch, Hampshire (2011 T152, HAMP-8A11A7, 3.98g) valued at £400. Taking account of all of the above, the Committee recommended £600. The British Museum hopes to acquire.

58. Early Medieval gold mount from Cambridgeshire area (2014 T235, CAM-B9DFC5)

The provisional valuer suggested £500. The Committee viewed the mount in light of this and concurred with the sentiments expressed by the valuer. The mount appeared to have been crudely made and to have suffered subsequent damage and the Committee felt that the provisional valuer's estimate was too generous. It recommended £400. The British Museum hopes to acquire.

59. Medieval gold mount from Thurleigh, Bedfordshire (2013 T876, BH-313738)- 3rd viewing

The first provisional valuer suggested £3,500. The finder had submitted comments regarding the first provisional valuation. The Committee had seen the mount at its meeting of 10th September 2014, considered the finder's comments, and requested a second valuation. The second provisional valuer suggested £3,000-£4,000. The Committee viewed the item for a second time at its meeting of 29th October 2014 and recommended £4,000. The finder supplied private valuations from [REDACTED] of Dukes at £3,000-£6,000 and from [REDACTED] of Sotheby's at £4,000-£6,000.

The Committee took account of all of the above as it considered the mount again. It was noted that the two private valuations had been supplied on the basis of photographs and that they provided little rationale behind the figures they suggested. The Committee noted that the ranges of all four valuers were very similar, but accepted that this spread indicated that its previous recommended valuation was slightly low. Highlighting the interesting iconography of the piece, which the Committee felt would appeal to buyers, it felt that a fair valuation was £4,500. The British Museum hopes to acquire.

60. Roman silver coin (catalogue number 6 only) from Thruxton, Hampshire (2014 T599, GLO-9D7F36)

The provisional valuer suggested that the coin had no commercial value. The Committee examined the coin in light of this and agreed that although it was in poor condition, it possessed a modicum of interest and felt that it was worth a nominal value. The Committee recommended £10. The British Museum hopes to acquire.

Item 6: Any other business

Provisional valuations (I): Claire Grindy, consultant with Sotheby's, has expressed an interest in providing Provisional Valuations. The Secretariat had explained to her the nature of the material that comes before the Committee and asked whether she felt qualified to assess it. Ms Grindy has yet to respond so this issue was deferred until she does.

Provisional valuations (II): The last meeting between the Committee and the provisional valuers was in December 2012. It was proposed that it would be appropriate to hold another such meeting this year. The Committee agreed that this was a good idea. The Secretariat explained that the next meeting would be in a smaller room, not suitable for a large crowd, so it was proposed to have the valuer's attend the following meeting, on 2nd December, from 11:00- 11:30, in the Boardroom.

The following topics were suggested for discussion:

- Introduction of new Committee members and new valuers
- Summary of the work of the Committee (#'s of cases dealt with)
- Clarification of terms of reference for provisional valuations, specifically:
 - explaining that it is helpful to cite a few, relevant comparanda
 - requesting that the tone of the narrative match the suggested figure

- that suggested ranges should be relatively precise. Wide ranges are unhelpful
- Provision of an sample valuation that the Committee finds helpful; [REDACTED]
valuation of 2013 T876
- Opportunities for questions

Item 7: Next meeting

The next meeting was rescheduled for Thursday, 15th October, 2015 at 11:00am. The meeting will be held in the Binyon Room of the World Conservation and Exhibition Centre (WCEC). It was suggested that after collecting their passes, Committee members meet a member of the Treasure team at 10:15am at the Information Desk, to be taken to the meeting room.

